



City of Marco Island Florida

51 Bald Eagle Drive
Marco Island, Florida
cityofmarcoisland.com

Meeting Minutes - Final

Planning Board

Chair: Ron Goldstein
Vice-Chair: Claire Babrowski

*Board Members: Jason Bailey, Michael Finkle, Ed Issler,
Joseph Rola, David Vergo*
Staff Liaison: Daniel Smith, Mary Holden and Jason Smalley
Planning Board Attorney: Paul Gougelman

Friday, April 5, 2019

9:00 AM

Community Room

(1) CALL TO ORDER

Chair Goldstien called the meeting to order at 9:00 A.M.

(2) ROLL CALL

Present 5 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Vergo, Vice-Chair Babrowski, Board Member Rola, and Chair Goldstein

Absent 2 - Board Member Finkle, and Board Member Bailey

(3) PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE - Led by Chair Goldstein

(4) ADDENDA TO THE AGENDA

(IT IS NOTED FOR THE RECORD, THE ITEMS ON THE AGENDA APPEAR IN NUMERICAL ORDER IN THE MINUTES.)

MOTION by Board Member Issler, seconded by Board Member Vergo, to approve the Agenda. MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 5 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Vergo, Vice-Chair Babrowski, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

(5) BOARD ABSENCES

All Board Members who were present indicated that they would be present for the next Planning Board Meeting on May 3, 2019.

(6) APPROVAL OF MINUTES

[ID 19-196](#) Planning Board Meeting Minutes of March 15, 2019

MOTION by Board Member Issler, seconded by Vice-Chair Babrowski, to approve the March 15, 2019 Planning Board Meeting Minutes. MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 5 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Vergo, Vice-Chair Babrowski, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

(7) STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

Community Affairs Director Dan Smith provided the Board Members with the following updates:

- *Next Planning Board Meeting is May 3, 2019*
- *Site Plan amendment for the Hideaway Beach clubhouse*
- *Dumpster enclosure language*
- *Land Development Code (LDC) proposal allowing cut in*
- *He will forward the original nautical garage discussions to the Board Members*
- *He will forward the Strategic Planning Report when it is available*

(8) COMMUNITY FORUM/PUBLIC COMMENT - None

(9) OLD BUSINESS

- a. [ID 19-192](#) RESOLUTION - CONTINUED from 3/1/19 - A Conditional Use Request (CUP-18-006283) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1216 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145

(Editorial History: The Petitioner is requesting a Conditional Use to construct a nautical garage, including constructing a seawall cut in to be located underneath a new two-story single-family residence proposed for 1216 Orange Court. The property in question is an approximately 100' wide x 110' deep residential lot located in zoning district RSF-3 with a lot area of approximately 10,890. The lot is currently vacant. A proposed dwelling unit that consist of seven bedrooms and is approximately 5,796-square feet under roof. The new dwelling unit will span over the seawall cut in to create a boat lift/ nautical garage, the nautical garage is an integrated element of the structure.)

Planning Board Attorney Paul Gougelman swore in all witnesses and the Board Members provided their ex-parte communications.

Planner II Jason Smalley presented the project and answered the Board Member's questions and concerns.

Public Comment: None

MOTION by Board Member Vergo, seconded by Vice-Chair Babrowski, to recommend approval to City Council, A Conditional Use Request (CUP-18-006283) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1216 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145. MOTION FAILED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 2 - Board Member Vergo and Vice-Chair Babrowski

No: 3 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

MOTION by Board Member Issler, seconded by Board Member Rola, to recommend denial to City Council, A Conditional Use Request (CUP-18-006283) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1216 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145, making a finding it is not consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because it is not a small town character type of construction. MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 3 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

No: 2 - Board Member Vergo and Vice-Chair Babrowski

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

- b. [ID 19-193](#) RESOLUTION - CONTINUED from 3/1/19 - A Conditional Use request (CUP-18-006284) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1224 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145.

(Editorial History: The Petitioner is requesting a Conditional Use to construct a nautical garage, including constructing a seawall cut in to be located underneath a new two-story single-family residence proposed for 1224 Orange Court. The property in question is an approximately 96' wide x 110' deep residential lot located in zoning district RSF-3 with a lot area of approximately 11,827. The previous structure has been demolished to make way for a new dwelling unit that consist of five bedrooms and is approximately 12,596-square feet under roof. The new dwelling unit will span over the seawall cut in to create a boat lift/ nautical garage, the nautical garage is an integrated element of the structure.)

Planning Board Attorney Paul Gougelman swore in all witnesses and the Board Members provided their ex-parte communications.

Planner II Jason Smalley presented the project and answered the Board Member's questions and concerns.

Planning Board Attorney Paul Gougelman read into the record the requirement in the Land Development Code (LDC) regarding flushing analysis.

Mr. Mathew Fleming with Humiston and Moore Engineers, 5679 Strand Court, Naples Florida 34110, answered the Board Member's questions and concerns regarding the modeling.

Mr. Todd Schneider with APM Homes, 939 Chalmer Drive, Marco Island, Florida 34145, noted he is the builder for the first nautical garage on Marco Island and answered the Board Member's questions and concerns. It is noted for the record his renderings of 1208 Orange Court have been attached to file ID 19-193.

Public Comment:

Mr. Gary Griswold, 1231 Butterfly Court, asked why a second building is being approved with modeling data when there is actual data from the first building.

MOTION by Board Member Vergo, seconded by Vice-Chair Babrowski, to recommend approval to City Council, A Conditional Use request (CUP-18-006284) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1224 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145. MOTION FAILED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 2 - Board Member Vergo and Vice-Chair Babrowski

No: 3 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

MOTION by Board Member Issler, seconded by Board Member Rola, to recommend denial to City Council, A Conditional Use request (CUP-18-006284) for the construction of a Seawall cut in / Nautical Garage for a property located at 1224 Orange Court, Marco Island, Florida 34145, making a finding it is not consistent with the Comprehensive Plan because it is not a small town character type of construction. MOTION CARRIED BY THE FOLLOWING VOTE:

Yes: 3 - Board Member Issler, Board Member Rola and Chair Goldstein

No: 2 - Board Member Vergo and Vice-Chair Babrowski

Not Present: 2 - Board Member Finkle and Board Member Bailey

c. [ID 19-194](#) DISCUSSION - CONTINUED from 1/4/19 - Definition of Guesthouse

The Board Members engaged in discussions regarding a definition of a guesthouse and it was determined to forward this topic for further consideration.

(10) NEW BUSINESS - None

(11) BOARD COMMUNICATIONS - None

(12) ADJOURN

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:58 A.M.

Ronald Goldstein, Planning Board Chair

PREPARED BY:

Lisa Smith, Recording Specialist